PALM BEACH COUNTY TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED (TD) LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD (LCB) AGENDA

DATE: Wednesday, February 12, 2020
TIME: 2:00 p.m.
PLACE: Palm Beach TPA Office
301 Datura Street, West Palm Beach, FL 33401

A map of transportation facilities to access the TPA Office are shown on page 3.

1. REGULAR ITEMS
   A. Pledge of Allegiance
   B. Roll Call
   C. MOTION TO ADOPT Agenda for February 12, 2020
   D. MOTION TO APPROVE Minutes for October 30, 2019
   E. Comments from the Chair
   F. LCB Liaison Report
   G. New Member Introductions
   H. General Public Comments

   Any members from the public wishing to speak at this meeting must complete a Comment Card that is available at the welcome table. General Public comments will be heard prior to the consideration of the first action item. Public comments on specific items on the agenda will be heard following the presentation of the item to the committee. Please limit comments to three minutes.

2. INFORMATION ITEMS
   A. FY 20 Community Transportation Coordinator (CTC) Evaluation

   The LCB will begin the FY20 CTC Evaluation, which will be presented at the May 13, 2020 meeting. LCB members are requested to participate in the CTC Evaluation process.

   B. CTC Update

   Palm Tran staff will provide an update.

   C. LCB Member Presentation

   David Rafaids will present on his roles and responsibilities related to transportation disadvantaged.

   D. Partner Agency Updates

   Staff from South Florida Regional Transportation Authority, Florida Department of Transportation, and/or Palm Beach County may provide brief updates on items relevant to the TD LCB.
4. **ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

A. Member Comments

B. **Next Meeting - Wednesday, May 13, 2020**

C. Adjournment

**Purpose of TD LCB:** The purpose of the LCB is to identify local service needs and to provide information, advice, and direction to the Palm Beach County Community Transportation Coordinator, otherwise known as Palm Tran Connection, on the coordination of service to be provided to the transportation disadvantaged through the Florida Coordinated Transportation System. The LCB is recognized as an advisory body to the Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged. Palm Tran’s provision of TD service is funded with state dollars. This service is not mandated by Federal Law.

**NOTICE**

In accordance with Section 286.0105, Florida Statutes, if a person decides to appeal any decision made by the board, agency, or commission with respect to any matter considered at such meeting or hearing, he or she will need a record of the proceedings, and that, for such purposes, he or she may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based.

Public participation is solicited without regard to race, color, national origin, age, sex, religion, disability or family status. Persons who require special accommodations under the Americans with Disabilities Act or persons who require translation services for a meeting (free of charge), please call 561-725-0813 or send email to MBooth@PalmBeachTPA.org at least five business days in advance. Hearing impaired individuals are requested to telephone the Florida Relay System at #711.
Attending a meeting at the Palm Beach TPA Office
301 Datura Street, West Palm Beach, FL 33401
TD LCB MEMBERS

**CHAIR**

Steven Grant, Mayor  
City of Boynton Beach

Milory Senat  
Agency for Persons with Disabilities  
*Alternate: Mary Edwards*

Vacant  
Area Agency on Aging

Tomas Boiton  
Citizen Advocate

Tekesha Saffold  
Citizen Advocate/User

Elisa Cramer  
Department of Children and Family Services

Maria Hernandez  
Florida Agency for Health Care Administration  
*Alternate: Marielisa Amador*

Marie Dorismond  
Florida Department of Transportation  
*Alternate: Wibet Hay*

Angela Choice  
Florida Department of Veterans Affairs

**VICE CHAIR**

David Rafaidus  
Palm Beach County Community Action  
Department of Community Services

Jeanie Chrisman  
Private Transportation Industry

Robyn Manuel  
Florida Division of Vocational Rehabilitation

Merlene Ramnon  
Local Medical Community

Laura Schultze  
Public Education  
School District of Palm Beach County

Robert Goodman  
Representative for the Disabled

Angie Morlok  
Representative for the Elderly

Elisa DeGoias  
Workforce Development Board

Clinton Forbes  
Mass/Public Transit Industry  
Palm Tran  
*Alternate: Chad Hockman*

COMMUNITY TRANSPORTATION COORDINATOR
OFFICIAL MEETING MINUTES OF THE
PALM BEACH COUNTY TRANSPORTATION DISADVANTAGED (TD)
LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD (LCB)

October 30, 2019
Vista Center 1st Floor Hearing Chambers
2300 North Jog Road
West Palm Beach, Florida 33411

PDF versions of the agenda, backup material and presentations as well as audio recordings are available for review at
www.PalmBeachTPA.org/LCB

1. REGULAR ITEMS
Mayor Grant called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

1.A. Pledge of Allegiance

1.B. Roll Call

The recording secretary called the roll. A quorum was present as depicted in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Attendance</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Attendance</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Attendance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grant</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Dorismond</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Ramnon</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boiton</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Goodman</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Saffold</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Hernandez</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Schultze</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrisman</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Manuel</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Senat</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cramer</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Morlok</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Watts</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DeGoias</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Rafaidus</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P = Present  A = Absent

1.C. ADOPTED: Agenda for October 30, 2019

MOTION to Adopt the Agenda. Motion by Mr. David Rafaidus, seconded by Mr. Robert Goodman, and carried unanimously 11-0.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grant</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Dorismond</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ramnon</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boiton</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Goodman</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Saffold</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Hernandez</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Schultze</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrisman</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Manuel</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Senat</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cramer</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Morlok</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Watts</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DeGoias</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Rafaidus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Y = Yes  N = No  A = Absent  ABST = Abstain
1.D. **APPROVED:** Minutes for August 14, 2019

**MOTION to Approve the Minutes.** Motion by Mr. David Rafaidus, seconded by Ms. Marie Dorismond, and carried unanimously 11-0.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grant</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Dorismond</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ramnon</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolton</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Goodman</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Saffold</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Hernandez</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Schultz</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrisman</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Manuel</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Senat</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cramer</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Morlok</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Watts</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DeGoias</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Rafaidus</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Y = Yes  N = No  A = Absent  ABST = Abstain

Ms. Milory Senat joined the meeting at 2:01 p.m.

1.E. **Comments from the Chair**

MAYOR GRANT stated he attended the Association of Metropolitan Planning Organizations (AMPO) Conference in Baltimore, Maryland and gave a brief overview of the conference.

1.F. **LCB Liaison Report**

MS. ALYSSA FRANK, TPA Transportation Planner, reviewed the following from the provided Liaison’s Report:

- Staff attended the Commission for Transportation Disadvantaged (CTD) annual training workshop in Orlando, FL on September 15-18, 2019. At the September 16 CTD Business meeting, there was a robust discussion regarding changes to Rule 41-2.014, which includes the process used to distribute funds each year to Trip and Equipment Grant awardees. This was an information item and will be a part of the upcoming Legislative session for additional discussion.

- The Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) is in the process of updating the Florida Transportation Plan which defines goals, objectives, and strategies for Florida’s transportation system. FDOT is seeking public input via an online survey at: [https://rsgsurvey.com/ftpsurvey/survey/1/en-us?bl=1](https://rsgsurvey.com/ftpsurvey/survey/1/en-us?bl=1).

- The next TPA Governing Board meeting will be held on Thursday, December 12 at 9:00 a.m. at the Royal Palm Beach Cultural Center, 151 Civic Center Way, Royal Palm Beach, FL 33411.

- The TPA is moving to a new office located at 301 Datura Street, West Palm Beach, FL 33401. All future TPA Governing Board, advisory committee, and LCB meetings will be held at this location. Meeting directions will be provided prior to the February 12, 2020 LCB meeting.

- LCB members are encouraged to provide a 5-10 minute presentation on how their agency and everyday work relates to the transportation disadvantaged. If interested in presenting at a future LCB meeting, contact Alyssa Frank at [AFrank@PalmBeachTPA.org](mailto:AFrank@PalmBeachTPA.org).

1.G. **New Member Introductions**

MS. MERLENE RAMNON introduced herself as the Representative for the Florida Department of Health for Palm Beach County and provided a brief review of her credentials.
1.H. General Public Comments
There were no general public comments received.

2. ACTION ITEMS
2.A. APPROVED: FY 2018-22 Transportation Disadvantaged Service Plan (TDSP) FY 2020 Annual Update

MS. FRANK reviewed the FY 2018-22 TDSP annual minor update and noted a major update occurs every five (5) years. She stated the TDSP is a tactical plan jointly developed by the Designated Official Planning Agency (DOPA) and Community Transportation Coordinator (CTC), which contains development, service and quality assurance components. She reviewed the TDSP minor updates that included changes to the membership; ten (10) top trip generators; needs assessment; goals, objectives and strategies; operations element; accessing services; trip rates; FY 2020 Grievance Procedures; and FY 2020 Rate Model Worksheet. These changes were shown in strikethrough and underline formatting.

MR. ROBERT GOODMAN inquired if the wheelchair rate was per person utilizing a wheelchair or per wheelchair van.

MR. LOU FERRI, Palm Tran Operations Manager, noted the wheelchair rate is based on per person per wheelchair and billed to the Trip and Equipment grant.

MS. ANGIE MORLOK requested a revision to Page 17, regarding average trips per year, to clarify the difference with subscription trips.

MOTION to Approve the FY 2018-22 TDSP FY 2020 Annual Update. Motion by Mr. David Rafaidus and seconded by Ms. Angie Morlok. A roll call vote was taken and carried unanimously 12-0.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Vote</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grant</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Dorismond</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ramnon</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolton</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Goodman</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Saffold</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Hernandez</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Schultz</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chrisman</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Manuel</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Senat</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cramer</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Morlok</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Watts</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DeGoias</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Rafaidus</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Y = Yes  N = No  A = Absent  ABST = Abstain

3. INFORMATION ITEMS

MS. FRANK stated as the DOPA the Palm Beach TPA must annually review the AER and forward comments to the Commission for Transportation Disadvantaged (CTD). She reviewed the local and direct federal funding for the Coordinated Transportation, Transportation Alternatives, and Other categories.

There was no discussion on this item.

3.B. DISCUSSED: CTC Update

MR. FERRI reviewed the TD Trip Report for September 2019 along with the trip purpose data to provide a snapshot of the Palm Tran Connection trips that occur daily. He reviewed the Connection Efficiencies Project (CEP), which is an in-depth route performance maximization review of Palm Tran Connection. He stated the goal is to refresh and reexamine the Connection service and explore opportunities to make improvements. He noted a consultant was hired
with an aggressive timeline, and this item will be discussed in more detail at the November 23, 2019 Board of County Commissioners’ (BCC) Workshop. He highlighted details and photos of the new Connection vehicles that are planned to be in service by the first quarter of 2020.

A discussion ensued on planning for and connecting new housing developments to the current service.

MAYOR GRANT requested the top ten city-to-city trips be provided at the next LCB meeting.

MR. CHAD HOCKMAN, Palm Tran Senior Manager of Paratransit, expressed his appreciation of the investment made by the BCC with these expansion vehicles. He also highlighted how these vehicles will assist in reducing trip duration.

A discussion ensued on the vehicle specifics and metrics.

3.C. **DISCUSSED:** LCB Member Presentation

MR. ROBERT GOODMAN, Representative for the Disabled Community, presented on his roles and responsibilities related to the transportation disadvantaged. He stated his company is Florida Navigator LLC, which looks to educate the healthcare industry about the Rehabilitation Act and American with Disabilities Act. He stated they also educate the visually impaired and have found that most elderly do not have access or know their rights. He reviewed additional services his agency provides.

A brief discussion ensued about other services the agency offers.

3.D. **DISCUSSED:** iMoveU Mobility Management Pilot Program

MS. NATASHA SERRA, iMoveU.org founder, provided a review of the Mobility Management Pilot Program that is seeking to establish partnerships with private-paratransit transportation providers. She noted iMoveU is a local Florida non-profit that is seeking to provide Mobility Management coordination via the Assisted Rides software, in concert with the Designated Recipients, CTC’s and local coordination boards across the Treasure Coast. She reviewed the Assisted Rides software features and coordination with AlterNetWays Company to beta test the software as outlined in her PowerPoint presentation.

MAYOR GRANT suggested a presentation be made to the Palm Tran Service Board (PTSB) and City of Boynton Beach on this initiative.

A discussion ensued on the project undertaking with Board members providing feedback of other human service agencies that will benefit from a presentation.

3.E. **Partner Agency Updates**

There were no partner agency updates received.

4. **ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

4.A. **2020 Governing Board & Advisory Committee Meeting Dates**

There was no discussion on this item.

4.B. **Member Comments**

MR. GOODMAN expressed his continuing concerns regarding Palm Tran bus connections for the elderly. He inquired if there were any updates on AARP’s Age Friendly Initiative that was previously presented.

MS. FRANK noted the presentation was provided as an informational item for County municipalities to take action as the TPA can only provide assistance on this initiative.
MR. RAFAIDUS stated the Health and Human Services Citizens Advisory Committee received a presentation as well and they are working with the Area Agency on Aging and Senior Services department concerning activation and implementation of this initiative.

4.C. Next Meeting - Wednesday, February 12, 2020

4.D. Adjournment

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 2:59 p.m.

This signature is to attest that the undersigned is the Chair, or a designated nominee, of the Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board and that information provided herein is the true and correct Minutes for the **October 30, 2019** meeting of the Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board, dated this ______ day of _________________, 2020.

____________________________________
Chair
## EXHIBIT A
Palm Beach County Transportation Disadvantaged Local Coordinating Board
Attendance Record: 2018-2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mayor Steven Grant, Chair</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tomas Boiton, Citizen Advocate</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angela Choice, FL Department of Veteran’s Affairs</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeanie Chrisman, Private Transportation</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***E</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***E</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elisa Cramer, FL Department of Children &amp; Families</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elsa DeGoias, Workforce Development Board</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marie Dorismond/Wibet Hay, Florida Department of Transportation</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Goodman, Representative for the Disabled</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria Hernandez/Marielisa Amador, FL Agency for Healthcare Administration/Medicaid Program</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robyn Manuel, Department of Education/Division of Vocational Rehabilitation</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angela Morlok, Representative for the Elderly</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Rafaidus, Vice Chair - Department of Community Services</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merlene Ramnon, FL Department of Health for Palm Beach County</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>***E</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tekesha Saffold, Citizen Advocate</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laura Schultzze, School District of Palm Beach County</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milory Senat/Mary Edwards, Agency for Persons with Disabilities</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>ALT</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tessie Watts, Area Agency on Aging</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*** New Appointment  P - Representative Present  ALT - Alternate Present
E - Excused  A - Absent  -- - Vacant
EXHIBIT A (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OTHERS PRESENT</th>
<th>REPRESENTING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marielisa Amador</td>
<td>AHCA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natasha Serra</td>
<td>iMoveU.org</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felix Collazo</td>
<td>MV Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lou Ferri</td>
<td>Palm Tran Connection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chad Hockman</td>
<td>Palm Tran Connection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malissa Booth</td>
<td>Palm Beach Transportation Planning Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alyssa Frank</td>
<td>Palm Beach Transportation Planning Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valerie Neilson</td>
<td>Palm Beach Transportation Planning Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margarita Pierce</td>
<td>Palm Beach Transportation Planning Agency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Connection Efficiencies Project ("CEP")

Agenda

- Introduction
- Overview of Palm Tran Connection, TD and ADA
- The Connection Efficiencies Project (CEP) Process
- Current Palm Tran Connection (PTC) Performance
- Peer Comparisons
- Identification of Issues
- Recommendations for Efficiencies
CEP Recommendations

1. Enhanced Eligibility Assessment
2. Overflow Service Option
3. Develop Non-ADA Service Delivery Options

Qualifications of Reviewer

- David Rishel, Delta Services Group, Inc.
  - 30+ years paratransit, ADA compliance
  - Designed NJ Transit statewide paratransit
  - Significant paratransit work
    - Los Angeles
    - Columbus
    - Philadelphia
    - Chicago
    - Louisville
    - Washington, D.C.
    - Palm Beach County
    - US Department of Justice
The CEP Review Process

- Main Questions:
  - How is Palm Tran Connection operating today?
  - What can be improved?

- Review Palm Tran Connection
  - On-site observations
  - Review of documents and processes
  - Peer Comparison
  - ADA Regulations
  - Industry best practices

Palm Tran Connection Program Overview

- Three paratransit programs:
  - Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) paratransit
    - Federally mandated service rules
    - No limits on capacity
    - “Civil Right” to access transportation
  - Transportation Disadvantaged (TD) program
    - State Program with limited State funding
    - Disability and income qualifications
  - Division of Senior Services (DOSS)
    - Nutrition
    - Federal Program through Area Agency on Aging (AAA)
    - Limited Funding from Federal Government
How is Palm Tran Connection Operating Today?

Current Service Statistics

Palm Tran Connection Cost & Ridership

- In FY19 Palm Tran overmatched the grants it received by almost $5 million
  - $2.99 million overmatch on Transportation Disadvantaged (TD) program which is an overmatch of 78%
  - $1.98 million overmatch on Division of Senior Services (DOSS) Program which is 5 times the grant award

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FY19 Ridership</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Program</strong></td>
<td><strong>Passengers Transported</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA</td>
<td>777,584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TD</td>
<td>149,601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOSS</td>
<td>59,371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>986,556</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Connection Programs Cost

Palm Tran Connection Program Cost for FY 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funding Sources</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ad Valorem</td>
<td>$18,002,889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas Tax</td>
<td>$13,500,302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grants</td>
<td>$3,099,039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fare Collection</td>
<td>$2,700,806</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$37,303,956</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Service Is Growing

Passengers Transported by Month
There is a Growing Flow of New Customers

On Time Performance is Struggling
Service Efficiency Remains Good...For Now

Palm Beach County’s Transit is Unique

- Very dense bus network along the coast
- Very limited bus service inland
- Paratransit serves everywhere in the County
Peer Comparison

HOW DOES PALM TRAN CONNECTION COMPARE TO ITS PEERS?

Peer Systems Selected for Comparison

In-State Peers
- Broward County Transit
- Central Florida RTA (Lynx)
- Jacksonville Transportation Authority
- Pinellas Suncoast Transit Authority

Out of State Peers
- Alameda-Contra Costa Transportation District (Bay Area, CA)
- Central Ohio Transit Authority (Columbus, OH)
- City of Phoenix Public Transit Department (Valley Metro)
- Nassau Inter County Express (Long Island, NY)
- Pace Suburban Bus Division (Suburban Chicago)

* Comparison data sourced from 2017 National Transit Database (NTD)
### Palm Tran’s Paratransit Share of Budget

- 33% of Palm Tran’s operating budget is used for paratransit operations
  - Highest of its peers (Florida systems in yellow)
- National Average 15-20%

#### Paratransit as a % of Total Operating Cost

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System</th>
<th>Paratransit Share</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Palm Tran</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broward County Transit</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Florida RTA</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacksonville Transport. Authority</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nassau Inter County Express (Long Island, NY)</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACE (Chicago)</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valley Metro (Phoenix)</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alameda Contra Costa (Oakland)</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinellas Suncoast Transit Authority</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Ohio Transit Authority</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Palm Tran’s Paratransit Share of Fleet

- 70% of the Palm Tran fleet is paratransit vehicles
- Nationally 1/4 to 1/3 of fleets are paratransit

#### Paratransit as a % of Total Bus Fleet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System</th>
<th>Paratransit Share</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Palm Tran</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinellas Suncoast Transit Authority</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broward County Transit</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Florida RTA</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacksonville Transport. Authority</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nassau Inter County Express (Long Island, NY)</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACE (Chicago)</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alameda Contra Costa (Oakland)</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valley Metro (Phoenix)</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nassau Inter County Express (Long Island, NY)</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Ohio Transit Authority</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other Areas of Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>PTC</th>
<th>National Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cost Per Trip</td>
<td>~$35.00 Per Trip</td>
<td>$23.00 to $53.00/trip</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>~1.6 Trips Per Hour</td>
<td>ADA Average ~1.0 TPH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fares</td>
<td>Charge 1.75X Fixed Route</td>
<td>Charge 2X Fixed Route</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On Time Performance</td>
<td>High 70% range</td>
<td>Goal ~92%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Florida-Specific Comparison

- ADA – Federal Requirement is ¾ mi. from Fixed Route
- TD – Most agencies limit after State funding expended
- DOSS – Paratransit providers do not typically operate this type of program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>ADA</th>
<th>TD</th>
<th>DOSS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Palm Tran</td>
<td>Beyond ¾ Mile</td>
<td>Not Limited</td>
<td>Not Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broward County Transit</td>
<td>¾ mi</td>
<td>As Funded</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Florida RTA (Lynx)</td>
<td>¾ mi</td>
<td>As Funded</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jacksonville Transportation Authority</td>
<td>¾ mi</td>
<td>As Funded</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinellas Suncoast Transit Authority</td>
<td>¾ mi</td>
<td>As Funded</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Major Points</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Steady growth in demand for paratransit service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Average of 360 new ADA eligible customers per month</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Better than average efficiency (Productivity)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decreasing on time performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Unusually large proportion of paratransit compared to fixed route bus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• PTC compares well to peers for efficiency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The growth on Palm Tran Connection is effecting performance and this will continue.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connection Efficiencies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**CONNECTION EFFICIENCIES PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS**
Challenge #1: Currently not Assessing “Need” for Paratransit

- ADA Paratransit is intended for passengers unable to ride accessible fixed route buses
  - Currently “registering” customers for paratransit vs. assessing need for paratransit
  - Palm Tran offers a large, fully accessible fixed route system
  - Currently, virtually no denials of eligibility
  - There has never been an ADA eligibility appeal

- If customers can ride the fixed route bus, that should be the first choice.

Recommendation #1: Develop Enhanced Eligibility Assessment

- Interview and Functional Assessment
  - Medical verification as needed

- Focus on customer needs/abilities

- Educate customers about Fixed Route and other transportation options

- Conditional and trip-by-trip decisions
  - Paratransit and bus to meet customer needs
  - Changes to Reservations booking policy

- Estimated Cost:
  - Approximately $1 - $1.5 Million annually
Recommendation #1: Example: Central Ohio Transit Authority Assessment Center

Challenge #2: High Peak Demand Challenges PTC
Recommendation #2: PTC Needs an “Overflow” Service Option

- All paratransit has high peaks in demand; denials are not permitted
  - An overflow provider can handle excess peak demand
- Paratransit often has unusual single trips to outlying areas in the evening or off-peak
  - Overflow providers can take inefficient, outlying trips
- A contract with a Taxi, Transportation Network Company (TNC), or similar provider can help with peak and outlier trip demand
  - Provides a cushion to increase capacity
  - Paid only when used
- Based on current needs estimated $500,000 annually

Challenge #3: ADA Service Area Exceeds Requirements

- Requirement: ¾ Mile of local bus routes
  - Exceeding service area requirements
- PTC: Everything East of FL Turnpike
  - Exceeding time of day requirements
- All trips are scheduled and managed like ADA trips
  - Current policies are making service tougher to implement
Recommendation #3: Develop Non-ADA Alternatives

- Palm Tran has options for non-ADA trips
  - Scheduling flexibility
  - Prioritization
  - Fares for extra services

- Begin analysis of non-ADA trips to identify alternative scheduling and service delivery options
  - Mobility on Demand
  - Mini-Routes
  - Premium Services

- Cost: Planning and Analysis <$100k
  - Possible new service options

Proposed Implementation Schedule

- Immediate Actions (December 2019 – February 2020):
  - Refine current eligibility assessment process, enhance screening
  - Begin drafting new eligibility process
  - Begin analysis of Non-ADA trips

- Short Term (March 2020):
  - New assessment process draft, plan implementation
  - Scope of work for new overflow provider complete
    - Begin Procurement
  - Report on options for Non-ADA trip delivery
Next Steps

• Impact of Changes

• Communication, Communication, Communication!

• Seeking Board Guidance, Input and Direction
  o Enhanced Eligibility Assessment
  o Overflow Service Option
  o Develop Non-ADA Service Delivery Options

• Discussion / Questions